Development Methods and Approaches Critical Reflections

Oxfam GB

Oxfam GB, founded in 1942, is a development, humanitarian, and campaigning agency dedicated to finding lasting solutions to poverty and suffering around the world. Oxfam believes that every human being is entitled to a life of dignity and opportunity, and it works with others worldwide to make this become a reality.

From its base in Oxford in the United Kingdom, Oxfam GB publishes and distributes a wide range of books and other resource materials for development and relief workers, researchers and campaigners, schools and colleges, and the general public, as part of its programme of advocacy, education, and communications.

Oxfam GB is a member of Oxfam International, a confederation of 12 agencies of diverse cultures and languages, which share a commitment to working for an end to injustice and poverty – both in long-term development work and at times of crisis.

For further information about Oxfam's publishing, and online ordering, visit www.oxfam.org.uk/publications

For more information about Oxfam's development and humanitarian relief work around the world, visit www.oxfam.org.uk

Development Methods and Approaches Critical Reflections

Selected essays from Development in Practice

Introduced by Jo Rowlands

A Development in Practice Reader

Series Editor Deborah Eade



First published by Oxfam GB in 2003

© Oxfam GB 2003

ISBN 0 85598 494 5

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

All rights reserved. Reproduction, copy, transmission, or translation of any part of this publication may be made only under the following conditions:

- with the prior written permission of the publisher; or
- with a licence from the Copyright Licensing Agency Ltd., 90 Tottenham Court Road, London WIP 9HE, UK, or from another national licensing agency; or
- · for quotation in a review of the work; or
- under the terms set out below.

This publication is copyright, but may be reproduced by any method without fee for teaching purposes, but not for resale. Formal permission is required for all such uses, but normally will be granted immediately. For copying in any other circumstances, or for re-use in other publications, or for translation or adaptation, prior written permission must be obtained from the publisher, and a fee may be payable.

Available from:

Bournemouth English Book Centre, PO Box 1496, Parkstone, Dorset, BH12 3YD, UK tel: +44 (0)1202 712933; fax: +44 (0)1202 712930; email: oxfam@bebc.co.uk

USA: Stylus Publishing LLC, PO Box 605, Herndon, VA 20172-0605, USA tel: +1 (0)703 661 1581; fax: +1 (0)703 661 1547; email: styluspub@aol.com

For details of local agents and representatives in other countries, consult our website: http://www.oxfam.org.uk/publications

or contact Oxfam Publishing, 274 Banbury Road, Oxford OX2 7DZ, UK tel: +44 (0)1865 311 311; fax: +44 (0)1865 312 600; email: publish@oxfam.org.uk

Our website contains a fully searchable database of all our titles, and facilities for secure on-line ordering.

The Editor and Management Committee of *Development in Practice* acknowledge the support given to the journal by affiliates of Oxfam International, and by its publisher, Carfax, Taylor & Francis. The views expressed in this volume are those of the individual contributors, and not necessarily those of the Editor or publisher.

Published by Oxfam GB, 274 Banbury Road, Oxford OX2 7DZ, UK.

Printed by Information Press, Eynsham.

Oxfam GB is a registered charity, no. 202 918, and is a member of Oxfam International.

Contents

Contributors vii

Preface ix Deborah Eade

Beyond the comfort zone: some issues, questions, and challenges in thinking about development approaches and methods I *Jo Rowlands*

Dissolving the difference between humanitarianism and development: the mixing of a rights-based solution 21 *Hugo Slim*

Should development agencies have Official Views? 26 *David Ellerman*

Bridging the 'macro'-'micro' divide in policy-oriented research: two African experiences 44 *David Booth*

Capacity building: shifting the paradigms of practice 60 *Allan Kaplan*

Capacity building: the making of a curry 73 *William Postma*

Operationalising bottom–up learning in international NGOs: barriers and alternatives 86 *Grant Power, Matthew Maury, and Susan Maury*

Organisational change from two perspectives: gender and organisational development 104 *Penny Plowman* Beyond the 'grim resisters': towards more effective gender mainstreaming through stakeholder participation 124 *Patricia L. Howard*

Sustainable investments: women's contributions to natural resource management projects in Africa 143 Barbara Thomas-Slayter and Genese Sodikoff

Critical Incidents in emergency relief work 167 Maureen Raymond-McKay and Malcolm MacLachlan

Tools for project development within a public action framework 183 David Wield

Ethnicity and participatory development methods in Botswana: some participants are to be seen and not heard 196 *Tlamelo Mompati and Gerard Prinsen*

Logical Framework Approach and PRA — mutually exclusive or complementary tools for project planning? 214 *Jens B. Aune*

Critical reflections on rapid and participatory rural appraisal 220 *Robert Leurs*

Participatory methodologies: double-edged swords 227 Eliud Ngunjiri

The Participatory Change Process: a capacity building model from a US NGO 234 Paul Castelloe and Thomas Watson

Two approaches to evaluating the outcomes of development projects 240 *Marion Meyer and Naresh Singh*

Resources 249

Addresses of publishers 276

Index 279

Contributors

Jens B. Aune is a researcher at the Centre for International Environment and Development Studies (Noragric) at the Agricultural University of Norway.

David Booth is a Research Fellow at the Overseas Development Institute; he was previously Professor of Development Studies at the University of Wales Swansea.

Paul Castelloe is Co-Director of the Center for Participatory Change in the USA.

David Ellerman was, until his retirement, Economic Advisor to the Chief Economist at the World Bank, and has written widely on economic democracy.

Patricia Howard is Professor of Gender Studies in Agriculture and Rural Development at Wageningen University in the Netherlands; she formerly worked for the FAO.

Allan Kaplan is a consultant and writer on development, and founder of the Community Development Resource Association (CDRA) in South Africa, which seeks to build the capacity of organisations engaged in development and social transformation.

Robert Leurs is a Lecturer in Participatory Development at the University of Birmingham, UK.

Malcolm MacLachlan is Associate Professor of Psychology at Trinity College, University of Dublin, Ireland and is currently Chairperson of Trinity Development Co-operation.

Matthew Maury is the Southern Africa Regional Director for Habitat for Humanity International, and has worked with various development NGOs throughout Asia, Africa, and Latin America.

Susan Maury is an Organisational Development consultant who focuses on helping development NGOs become learning organisations.

Marion N. Meyer is serving with the Mennonite Central Committee as the emergency-response coordinator for Central America and Mexico, based in Honduras.

Tlamelo O. Mompati lectures at the University of Botswana in the Department of Social Work.

Eliud Ngunjiri is Executive Director of Resources Oriented Development Initiatives (RODI), an NGO in Kenya.

Penny Plowman is a development consultant to NGOs and international agencies in the field of gender and development.

William Postma was, at the time of writing, Bangladesh Country Director of the Christian Reformed World Relief Committee (CRWRC).

Grant D. Power is currently a consultant for NGOs involved in communitybased, sustainable development in the USA and East Asia.

Gerard Prinsen was, at the time of writing, Training Coordinator for Extension Workers in the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning in Botswana.

Maureen Raymond-McKay was, at the time of writing, studying at Trinity College Dublin in Ireland.

Jo Rowlands is a Policy Adviser on Gender and Participation in Oxfam GB's UK Poverty Programme; formerly she worked for Voluntary Service Overseas. She has written extensively on gender and empowerment issues, with particular reference to Latin America.

Naresh C. Singh was, at the time of writing, Program Director for Employment and Sustainable Livelihoods and UN Activities at the International Institute for Sustainable Development in Canada.

Hugo Slim is Senior Lecturer in International Humanitarianism at Oxford Brookes University, UK, a Trustee of Oxfam GB, and an International Adviser to the British Red Cross.

Genese Sodikoff was, at the time of writing, studying at the University of Michigan in the USA.

Barbara P. Thomas-Slayter is Professor of International Development in Clark University's Department of International Development, Community and Environment. She is author or editor of several books on gender, ecology, and development, including *Gender*, *Environment and Development in Kenya*, and *Feminist Political Ecology*, global issues and local experience. She has recently served on the Board of Directors of Oxfam America.

Thomas Watson is Co-Director of the Center for Participatory Change in the USA.

David Wield is Professor of Innovation and Development at The Open University in the UK, and Co-Director of its International Development Centre.